

Article:

Storkel, H. (2022). Tutorial: Minimal, Maximal, or Multiple: Which Contrastive Intervention Approach to Use With Children With Speech Sound Disorders? *Language, Speech and Hearing Services in Schools*, 53, 632-645.

Summary:

The tutorial provides a description of the frequently used SSD intervention approach, minimal pairs, and contrasts it with less frequently used variants that can be more effective: Maximal oppositions, and multiple oppositions.

Conventional Minimal Pair

Best suited to older children, or children with mild SSD, characterized by a small number of error patterns. It involves pairing the target and its substitute/deletion in minimal pairs, and intervention activities that set up opportunities for communication breakdown.

The approach has been used in more than 40-50 research studies, dating back to 1981.

Maximal Oppositions

The approach has been used with children with mild to severe SSD from 3-8 years old, with multiple errors across multiple sound classes. Geirut's research showed that greater phonological change resulted when treatment focused on two inaccurate sounds, that differed by a major class and a maximal number of features. Two inaccurate sounds can be selected, or one inaccurate and one accurate. The heart of the approach is the sound selection e.g. obstruent 'f,' and sonorant 'l,' making 'face – lace, fan – lan' etc. The phonological activities of sorting and matching are included in the approach. The goal of maximal oppositions is to teach the child two new sounds that represent different aspects of the phonological system, and highlight diversity of the phonological system.

Multiple oppositions

This approach has been used with children 3-8 years, with moderate to severe SSD, and global phoneme collapse. A global phoneme collapse is elected, then the SLP selects 1-4 target sounds to pair with the substitute sound in minimal pairs (if only one target selected) to minimal quintuplets (if four targets selected). It is noted that FCD is considered a global phoneme collapse. Maximal classification and maximal distinction guide target selection. This approach can be more challenging for children who get discouraged.

For contrastive intervention approaches, 5 word sets were recommended. Research demonstrated that 5 sets resulted in 80% generalization to untreated word sets.

Clinical Implications/Discussion:

- Members found the article to clearly laid out and easy to read
- SLP's discussed the SCIP app mentioned in the tutorial. SLP's agreed it would be well suited for busy SLP's with many speech clients
- The recommendation of 5 pairs for generalization is something SLP's found to be valuable information
- FCD being considered a sound collapse suitable for multiple oppositions was an 'aha' moment for some members
- Members mentioned that the article had a school focus and largely did not focus on incorporating families into intervention

- One SLP noted that she found it easier for families to give speech feedback to their children with contrastive approaches. She also mentioned the she had noticed impressive improvement using the multiple oppositions approach.



Speech and Hearing BC

Critical Appraisal Form

Date: 22-Nov-23

Members in Discussion: 3