

## Critical Appraisal Form

Date: 19-May-21

Members in Discussion: 5

Article: Redmond, S. (2020). Clinical Intersections Among Idiopathic Language Disorder, Social (Pragmatic) Communication Disorder, and Attention-Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder *Journal of Speech, Language, and Hearing Research*, 63, 3263-3276.

**Summary:**

Co-occurrence rates of ADHD and idiopathic language disorder present as inconsistent and confusing. In this article, the potential application of various diagnostic criteria to co-occurrence rate is examined, and the consequences are presented.

**Method:**

A literature appraisal and empirical demonstration are applied to SLI, DLD, and DSM-5 language disorder designations. The extent to which these designations can prejudice the understanding about the boundaries between ADHD and Idiopathic Language Disorder is examined.

**Results:**

Overlap between diagnoses using different taxonomies varied from 2% - 22%. The lowest amount of overlap was with DSM-5 and its separation of SPCD (Social Pragmatic Communication Disorder) from language disorder. This provided the clearest segregation between ADHD and idiopathic language disorder (2% co-occurrence rate). The application of a broader DLD designation elevated co-occurrence rates to 22%. The overlap between language disorders and ADHD across taxonomies was mainly associated with overlap between language disorders and ADHD; This was primarily a function of the presence or absence of symptoms of SPCD.

**Strengths and Limitations of research article:**

There are no robust behavioural markers of S(P)CD, or diagnostic tool/s available for SPCD; Diagnosis of SPCD was improvised, limiting internal validity

Parental measures were used to rate the severity of ADHD and SPCD symptoms; Additional measures may have yielded different results.

	Compelling	Suggestive	Equivocal/Uncertain
Validity		X	
Clinical importance		X	

**Clinical Implications/Discussion:**

- Clinicians agreed that there was a lack of consistency with the diagnosis of the disorders included in the article
- Attention was brought to the presentation of classroom behavioural issues, and how this cohort of children can be more likely to be overlooked regarding the diagnosis of an underlying language impairment
- Clinicians mentioned that this article ‘highlights how much we don’t know,’ and one member planned to have a discussion with her co-workers about being “on the same messy page” with diagnosis
- Another clinician planned to share information about the overlap of symptoms with teachers